



27 date this issue has been primarily been addressed using H-isotope systematics (expressed as  
28  $\delta D$ , relative to Standard Mean Ocean Water; SMOW).

29       Based on a recent review of lunar apatite OH- $\delta D$  systematics ([McCubbin et al., 2015](#)),  
30 mare basalts have been noted to fall within two broad groups: 1) a relatively isotopically  
31 heavy  $\delta D$  suite, which lies above the terrestrial range ( $> +200$  ‰  $\delta D$ ), and 2) an isotopically  
32 lighter, Earth-like, suite ( $\sim 0$  to  $\sim 250$  ‰  $\delta D$ ). Within individual mare suites, several  
33 processes such as volatile degassing (which acts to increase  $\delta D$ ; [Tartèse and Anand, 2013](#)), or  
34 spallogenic production from cosmic-ray exposure (which will to decrease  $\delta D$ ; [Füri and](#)  
35 [Deloule, 2016](#)), can modify  $\delta D$  compositions from their inherited melt signature. However,  
36 recent reports of  $\delta D$  values that extend to compositions below the terrestrial range ( $+100$  to -  
37  $500$ ‰) from a range of lunar lithologies, including incompatible element rich KREEP basalts  
38 and evolved highland lithologies (such as quartz monzodiorites), have been argued to reflect  
39 a primordial, isotopically distinct, lunar mantle reservoir ([Barnes et al., 2014](#); [Robinson et al.,](#)  
40 [2014](#)). Such a reservoir has recently gained support by the occurrence of similar  $\delta D$   
41 compositions from basalts associated with the Icelandic mantle plume, which are interpreted  
42 to reflect deep ‘primordial’ signatures ([Hallis et al., 2015](#)); together providing some for the  
43 strongest evidence for a primordial origin for water in the Earth–Moon system ([Barnes et al.,](#)  
44 [2014](#)).

45       In this issue [Treiman et al. \(2016\)](#) presents an alternative case accounting for the  
46 relatively isotopically light apatite  $\delta D$  signatures, based on the mineral texture of the host  
47 basalts. The petrological context of apatite, and other OH-bearing phases, have been often  
48 overlooked within the literature, however, can provide important clues for putting water  
49 abundance and H-isotope systematics into context ([Pernet-Fisher et al., 2014](#)). In their  
50 model, [Treiman et al. \(2016\)](#) highlight that basalt samples with the lowest apatite  $\delta D$  values

51 also display the least amount of zoning within olivine and pyroxene phenocrysts. This  
52 suggests that these samples have been held at high temperatures for long periods relative to  
53 other basaltic samples that display large mineral zonal gradients. As a result of such a  
54 protracted thermal history, [Treiman et al. \(2016\)](#) propose a model whereby that these basalts  
55 incorporated an additional source of H during the emplacement of lavas flows onto the lunar  
56 regolith. The regolith, as the result of a long history of solar-wind and cosmic-ray  
57 implantation, is thought to be characterized by very isotopically light  $\delta D$  values ( $< -400\%$   
58  $\delta D$ ; [Epstein and Taylor, 1973](#)); thus, ‘metasomatism’ by regolith induced heating during lava  
59 flow emplacement, could act to lower the  $\delta D$  value of the overlying molten basaltic lava.  
60 Models of lunar regolith heating and degassing with hot lava interaction ([Rumpf et al., 2013](#)),  
61 and melt assimilation are not new, having been used to account for variable trace-element  
62 systematics for some high-Al Apollo 14 basalts ([Hui et al., 2011](#)) and for some xenocrystic  
63 spinel within some Apollo 12 basalts ([Dungan and Brown, 1977](#)). However, the extent to  
64 which the volatile element systematics will modify basalts through this process has to date  
65 not fully considered. Overall, [Treiman et al. \(2016\)](#) reinforces how important it is to consider  
66 the extent to which mixing with the underlying lunar regolith may modify mare basalts  
67 during their emplacement, particular for the most mobile and volatile elements.

68 **Acknowledgments:** Funded by STFC grant # ST/M001253/1

## 69 **References cited**

70 Barnes, J. J., Franchi, I. A., Anand, M., Tartèse, R., Starkey, N. A., Koike, M., & Russell, S.  
71 S. (2013). Accurate and precise measurements of the D/H ratio and hydroxyl content in lunar  
72 apatites using NanoSIMS. *Chemical Geology*, 337, 48-55.

73

74 Barnes, J. J., Tartèse, R., Anand, M., McCubbin, F. M., Franchi, I. A., Starkey, N. A., &  
75 Russell, S. S. (2014). The origin of water in the primitive Moon as revealed by the lunar  
76 highlands samples. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 390, 244-252.

77

78 Boyce, J. W., Liu, Y., Rossman, G. R., Guan, Y., Eiler, J. M., Stolper, E. M., & Taylor, L. A.  
79 (2010). Lunar apatite with terrestrial volatile abundances. *Nature*, 466, 466-469.

80

81 Canup, R. M., Visscher, C., Salmon, J., & Fegley Jr, B. (2015). Lunar volatile depletion due  
82 to incomplete accretion within an impact-generated disk. *Nature Geoscience*, 8, 918-921.

83

84 Dungan, M. A., & Brown, R. W. (1977). The petrology of the Apollo 12 ilmenite basalt suite.  
85 In *Lunar and Planetary Science Conference Proceedings* (Vol. 8, pp. 1339-1381).

86

87 Epstein, S., & Taylor Jr, H. P. (1973). The isotopic composition and concentration of water,  
88 hydrogen, and carbon in some Apollo 15 and 16 soils and in the Apollo 17 orange soil. In  
89 *Lunar and Planetary Science Conference Proceedings* (Vol. 4, p. 1559).

90

91 Fűri, E., & Deloule, E. (2016, March). New Constraints on the Production Rate of  
92 Cosmogenic Deuterium at the Moon's Surface. In *Lunar and Planetary Science Conference*  
93 (Vol. 47, p. 1351).

94

95 Greenwood, J. P., Itoh, S., Sakamoto, N., Warren, P., Taylor, L., & Yurimoto, H. (2011).  
96 Hydrogen isotope ratios in lunar rocks indicate delivery of cometary water to the Moon.  
97 *Nature Geoscience*, 4, 79-82.

98

99 Hallis, L. J., Huss, G. R., Nagashima, K., Taylor, G. J., Halldórsson, S. A., Hilton, D. R., &  
100 Meech, K. J. (2015). Evidence for primordial water in Earth's deep mantle. *Science*, 350,  
101 795-797.

102

103 Hui, H., Oshrin, J. G., & Neal, C. R. (2011). Investigation into the petrogenesis of Apollo 14  
104 high-Al basaltic melts through crystal stratigraphy of plagioclase. *Geochimica et*  
105 *Cosmochimica Acta*, 75, 6439-6460.

106

- 107 McCubbin, F. M., Kaaden, K. E. V., Tartèse, R., Boyce, J. W., Mikhail, S., Whitson, E. S., &  
108 Hauri, E. H. (2015). Experimental investigation of F, Cl, and OH partitioning between apatite  
109 and Fe-rich basaltic melt at 1.0–1.2 GPa and 950–1000 C. *American Mineralogist*, 100, 1790-  
110 1802.
- 111
- 112 Pernet-Fisher, J. F., Howarth, G. H., Liu, Y., Chen, Y., & Taylor, L. A. (2014). Estimating  
113 the lunar mantle water budget from phosphates: Complications associated with silicate-  
114 liquid-immiscibility. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 144, 326-341.
- 115
- 116 Robinson, K. L., Barnes, J. J., Tartèse, R., Nagashima, K., Hallis, L. J., Franchi, I. A., &  
117 Taylor, G. J. (2014, March). Primitive Lunar Water in Evolved Rocks?. In *Lunar and*  
118 *Planetary Science Conference* (Vol. 45, p. 1607).
- 119
- 120 Rumpf M. E. Fagents S. A., Crawford I. A., and Joy K. H. (2013) Numerical modelling of  
121 lava-regolith heat transfer on the Moon and implications for the preservation of implanted  
122 volatiles. *Journal of Geophysical Research*. Vol. 118. pp. 382-397.
- 123
- 124 Tartèse, R., Anand, M., Barnes, J. J., Starkey, N. A., Franchi, I. A., & Sano, Y. (2013). The  
125 abundance, distribution, and isotopic composition of Hydrogen in the Moon as revealed by  
126 basaltic lunar samples: Implications for the volatile inventory of the Moon. *Geochimica et*  
127 *Cosmochimica Acta*, 122, 58-74.
- 128
- 129 Tartèse, R., & Anand, M. (2013). Late delivery of chondritic hydrogen into the lunar mantle:  
130 Insights from mare basalts. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 361, 480-486.
- 131
- 132 Treiman, A. H., Boyce, J. W., Greenwood, J. P., Eiler, J. M., Gross, J., Guan, Y., Ma, C.,  
133 Stolper, E. M., (2016) D-poor hydrogen in lunar mare basalts assimilated from lunar regolith.  
134 *American Mineralogist*, this issue.
- 135
- 136 Wolf, R., Anders, E. (1980) Moon and Earth: compositional differences inferred from  
137 siderophiles, volatiles and alkalis in basalts. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 44, 2111–  
138 2124.