

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

Highlights and Breakthroughs

Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

(On the article *Crystal chemistry of martian minerals from Bradbury Landing through Naukluft Plateau, Gale crater, Mars* by Shaunna M. Morrison and others.)

Michael A. Velbel^{1,2}

¹Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences

206 Natural Science Building, 288 Farm Lane

Michigan State University

East Lansing, MI 48824-1115

²Division of Meteorites, Department of Mineral Sciences

National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian Institution

10th and Constitution Avenues NW, Washington, DC 20560-0119

E-mail: velbel@msu.edu

Submitted to American Mineralogist

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

24 Mineral chemistry and crystallography are both necessary for the full determination and
25 characterization of minerals, which are in turn necessary for thorough understanding of their
26 origin, genesis, and occurrence. Planetary remote sensing and surface-mission instruments
27 routinely return data about the chemical compositions of distant solar system materials, but not
28 crystallographic data. Only recently did the first intentionally crystallographic instrument
29 deployed anywhere in the solar system other than Earth – the CheMin X-ray diffractometer
30 (XRD) on Mars Science Laboratory (MSL) rover Curiosity (Blake et al. 2012) – begin
31 operations on the surface of Mars. Morrison and others (2018a) refine previously acquired
32 CheMin data for rock-forming silicate and oxide minerals, and some alteration products, in
33 unconsolidated wind-blown (dune) sediments and environmentally diverse clastic sedimentary
34 rocks encountered along Curiosity’s traverse through Gale Crater, Mars. These refined unit-cell
35 parameters constitute a much-strengthened foundation for the next generation of geologic and
36 petrologic interpretation of Mars’ surface minerals.

37 Minerals are defined by crystalline structure and specifiable composition or compositional range.
38 Structure and composition are related. The smallest structural constituents (for example, cations,
39 silica tetrahedra, or carbonate or sulfate anionic groups), and their linkages with one another,
40 have geometric attributes that are consequences of bonding between specific pairs of atoms.
41 Each member of the bonded pair is commonly visualized as having a size (e.g., an atomic or
42 ionic radius) and a charge (valence). Different combinations of elements commonly results in
43 different bond attributes and different structures. However, pairs of structures with similar
44 symmetry but different unit cell dimensions (isomorphs) are common, as are variations of unit
45 cell dimensions caused by substitutions for one another of ions with similar valence and bond
46 characteristics but slightly different size (solid solution). For many mineral groups, correlations

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

47 between chemical composition and unit cell parameters permit each to be estimated from the
48 other.

49 Where samples (including meteorites known to originate from Mars) are available in sufficient
50 abundance for examination in terrestrial laboratories, the full range of crystallographic and
51 compositional methods permits thorough identification and characterization of the minerals in
52 the samples. Many minerals have been well-characterized in meteorites from Mars, but specific
53 source areas on Mars are not known for any individual Mars meteorites, so meteoritic mineral
54 data cannot be linked to specific source regions on Mars.

55 Mars orbiters acquire images and spectra from large areas, but at spatial resolutions much
56 coarser than individual samples. Robotic surface landers and rovers acquire data at sample
57 (centimeter) scale. However, constrained as they are by cost, payload mass, volume, power, and
58 data transfer rates, the ensembles of instruments on individual landers and rovers include only a
59 subset of the analytical capabilities of terrestrial laboratories. One consequence of the hard
60 choices that must be made in selecting instruments is that crystallographic data are almost
61 entirely lacking. Planetary geology continues to advance with remote mineral characterization
62 data that are the best available, but still incomplete by the standards of terrestrial mineralogy.

63 As was the case in the progress of terrestrial mineralogy, scientific understanding of Mars’
64 surface materials was supported by morphological crystallography (supported by chemical data)
65 before X-ray crystallography. Eight years before Curiosity landed on Mars (2012), each of the
66 twin Mars Exploration Rovers (MERs) Spirit and Opportunity (landed 2004) carried a variety of
67 tools and instruments relevant to geology, geochemistry, and mineralogy (but not XRD). Each
68 rover’s Robotic Arm deployed a brush to remove dust and abraded fines; a Rotary Abrasion Tool

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

69 (RAT) for grinding (“RATting”) through weathered rock surfaces to expose fresh interior
70 materials; an Alpha Particle X-ray Spectrometer (APXS) for elemental abundances; and a
71 Microscopic Imager (MI; ~30 μm /pixel, yielding images with ~100 μm spatial resolution)
72 (Arvidson et al. 2006). Most MER MI images show rock shapes, vesicles, sedimentary
73 structures, grain sizes and shapes, and compaction features of Mars’ granular surface materials.
74 A few show euhedral features.

75 Mars Exploration Rover Opportunity encountered weathered outcrops of sedimentary rocks
76 (hematite-rich basaltic sandstones) in the Burns Formation at Meridiani Planum (Herkenhoff et
77 al. 2004; Squyres et al. 2004; Grotzinger et al. 2005; Herkenhoff et al. 2008). Some outcrop
78 surfaces displayed randomly oriented euhedral (blade-shaped) or discoid to lozenge shaped
79 cavities (collectively called vugs in the earliest papers) transecting sedimentary laminations
80 (Squyres et al. 2004; Herkenhoff et al. 2004, 2008). The euhedral cavities were interpreted as
81 moldic secondary porosity after euhedral crystals of a water-soluble early diagenetic mineral
82 (Herkenhoff et al. 2004, 2008; McLennan et al. 2005). Their parallelogram outlines are
83 consistent with a tabular (pinacoidal) habit of a mineral that is either monoclinic (Herkenhoff et
84 al. 2004; McLennan et al. 2005) or triclinic (Peterson and Wang 2006; Peterson et al. 2007).

85 Chemical data from Opportunity’s APXS and deconvolution of thermal-emission spectroscopic
86 (TES) data from Opportunity’s Mini-TES suggest that magnesium, calcium, or iron sulfate
87 minerals are present in abundances of $15\text{--}40 \pm 5$ modal volume percent (Rieder et al. 2004;
88 Christensen et al. 2004; McLennan et al. 2005). Several sulfate minerals consistent with
89 compositional data for these and related sedimentary rocks at Meridiani Planum are monoclinic
90 (gypsum, kieserite, hexahydrite; Herkenhoff et al. 2004; Squyres et al. 2004; Arvidson et al.

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

91 2005; melanterite, McLennan et al. 2005; starkeyite, Peterson et al. 2007) or triclinic
92 (pentahydrate, meridianiite; Peterson and Wang 2006).

93 Meridianiite ($\text{MgSO}_4 \cdot 11\text{H}_2\text{O}$) was experimentally synthesized, and recognized from natural
94 samples found at terrestrial locales with environmental conditions consistent with the solid’s
95 phase diagram (Peterson and Wang 2006; Peterson et al. 2007). The crystallographic parameters
96 of natural terrestrial meridianiite ($a = 6.7459 \text{ \AA}$, $b = 6.8173 \text{ \AA}$, $c = 17.280 \text{ \AA}$, $\alpha = 88.137^\circ$, $\beta =$
97 89.481° , $\gamma = 62.719^\circ$) (Peterson et al. 2007) include $a \approx b$ (within $\sim 1\%$) and $\alpha \approx \beta$, (both $< 2^\circ$
98 from perpendicular). Thus, the unit cell geometry of meridianiite is very close to monoclinic. If
99 the interpretation that the mineral removed to form the crystal molds observed at Meridiani
100 Planum is meridianiite (Peterson and Wang 2006; Peterson et al. 2007) is correct, then the earlier
101 interpretation that the crystal molds at Meridiani Planum represent a monoclinic mineral can be
102 accounted for. Measurements from the MI images would not have easily distinguished between
103 triclinic morphology with α and β so near 90° and monoclinic crystal morphology.

104 Images from Mars of crystal morphology have evoked the pioneering role of morphological
105 crystallography in the mineral sciences. Whereas morphological crystallography dominated
106 terrestrial mineralogy for more than a century before the X-ray diffraction revolution, XRD
107 arrived on Mars within a decade after the few tantalizing images of crystal morphology.

108 Although imagery from other rovers will continue to support tentative identifications of minerals
109 based on morphological crystallography, Curiosity’s CheMin XRD data enable greatly expanded
110 understanding of mineral structures and chemical compositions on Mars.

111 MSL rover Curiosity and its CheMin instrument are acquiring XRD data of primary minerals and
112 products of aqueous alteration in unconsolidated wind-blown sediments and fluvial, deltaic,

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

113 lacustrine, and aeolian sandstones, mudstones, and conglomerates at Gale Crater. Among the
114 signature findings uniquely enabled by CheMin, Treiman et al. (2016) used CheMin data to
115 determine compositions of alkali feldspar in sandstones at one sampling site, from their unit cell
116 parameters. Their results yield compositions strongly supporting the hypothesis that potassic
117 alkaline igneous rocks, a rock type for which evidence has “been indirect or speculative until
118 recently” (Treiman et al., 2016, p.98) on Mars, existed in the source area of the sampled
119 sandstones.

120 Morrison et al. (2018a) refine previously acquired CheMin data for plagioclase, sanidine,
121 clinopyroxenes, orthopyroxene, olivine, spinel, and minerals of the alunite-jarosite group. Using
122 each sample’s own plagioclase as an internal standard, Morrison et al. (2018a) correct for each
123 sample cell’s offset ($<80\ \mu\text{m}$ in all cases), its effect on the sample-cell-to-detector distance and
124 where the diffracted beam intersects the detector, and the consequences for Bragg’s Law
125 interpretation of the detected 2θ angles for all of that sample’s other minerals. The corrections
126 result in different values of unit cell parameters than previously reported for these samples (e.g.,
127 by up to $0.02\ \text{\AA}$ for olivine), which are in turn extremely important to the subsequent usefulness
128 of the unit cell parameters as indicators of mineral composition.

129 Morrison et al. (2018a) invoke regression relationships, that they establish in a companion paper
130 (Morrison et al. 2018b), between unit cell parameters and crystal chemical compositions from
131 published data for each relevant mineral group. Combining the improved unit cell parameters
132 and the crystallography-composition regression algorithms, they revise the minerals’ inferred
133 chemical compositions. The combined effects of sample-cell offset and the regression algorithms
134 result in compositions that differ subtly for some minerals, and appreciably for others, relative to

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

135 previously published compositions for the same minerals estimated from the pre-correction
136 CheMin data. For example, olivine compositions from sandstone sample Windjana were first
137 reported to be Fe-forsterite, $\sim\text{Fo}_{59\pm 06}$ (Treiman et al., 2016); correction for sample-cell offset
138 yields improved unit cell parameters corresponding to $\text{Fo}_{67.5}$ (Morrison et al., 2018a).

139 At the present state of NASA’s Mars Exploration Program planning, the mineral abundances and
140 compositions determined from MSL Curiosity CheMin data complete the only full mineralogical
141 data set for Mars surface materials until a Mars Sample Return mission (MSR), which is still at
142 least a decade away. The XRD data, acquired with Curiosity’s unique CheMin instrument and
143 corrected for small sample-stage offsets by Morrison et al. (2018a), enabled a major expansion
144 from and improvement upon all previous identifications of rock-forming minerals from Mars
145 mission data, all of which were based on observations that did not include crystallography. The
146 refined unit-cell parameters and the updated mineral compositions derived from them by
147 Morrison et al. (2018a) provide a firm new foundation for future interpretations of igneous-
148 mineral and -rock formation conditions, sediment provenance, pre-depositional and diagenetic
149 chemical alteration, and habitability assessment on Mars.

150

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

151 **References cited**

- 152 Arvidson, R.E., Poulet, F., Bibring, J.-P., Wolff, M., Gendrin, A., Morris, R.V., Freeman, J.J.,
153 Langevin, Y., Mangold, N., and Bellucci, G. (2005) Spectral Reflectance and Morphologic
154 Correlations in Eastern Terra Meridiani, Mars. *Science*, 307, 1591-1594.
- 155 Arvidson, R.E., Squyres, S.W., Anderson, R.C., Bell, J.F., III, Blaney, D., Brückner, J., Cabrol,
156 N.A., Calvin, W.M., Carr, M.H., Christensen, P.R., and others (2006) Overview of the Spirit
157 Mars Exploration Rover Mission to Gusev Crater: Landing site to Backstay Rock in the
158 Columbia Hills. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 111, E02S01, doi:10.1029/2005JE002499
- 159 Blake, D., Vaniman, D., Achilles, C., Anderson, R., Bish, D., Bristow, T., Chen, C., Chipera, S.
160 Crisp, J., Des Marais, D., and others (2012). Characterization and calibration of the CheMin
161 mineralogical instrument on Mars Science Laboratory. *Space Science Reviews*, 170, 341-399.
- 162 Christensen, P.R., Wyatt, M.B., Glotch, T.D., Rogers, A.D., Anwar, S., Arvidson, R.E.,
163 Bandfield, J.L., Blaney, D.L., Budney, C., Calvin, W.M., and others (2004) Mineralogy at
164 Meridiani Planum from the Mini-TES experiment on the Opportunity Rover. *Science*, 306, 1733-
165 1739.
- 166 Grotzinger, J.P., Arvidson, R.E., Bell, III, J.F., Calvin, W., Clark, B.C., Fike, D.A., Golombek,
167 M., Greeley, R., Haldemann, A., Herkenhoff, K.E., Jolliff, B.L., and others (2005) Stratigraphy
168 and Sedimentology of a dry to wet eolian depositional system, Burns formation, Meridiani
169 Planum, Mars. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 240, 11-72.

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

- 170 Herkenhoff, K.E., Squyres, S.W., Arvidson, R., Bass, D.S., Bell, J.F., III, Bertelsen, P.,
171 Ehlmann, B.L., Farrand, W., Gaddis, L., Greeley, R., and others (2004) Evidence from
172 Opportunity’s Microscopic Imager for water on Meridiani Planum: *Science*, 306, 1727-1730.
- 173 Herkenhoff, K.E., Grotzinger, J., Knoll, A.H., McLennan, S.M., Weitz, C., Yingst, A.,
174 Anderson, A., Archinal, B.A., Arvidson, R.E., Barrett, J.M., and others (2008) Surface processes
175 recorded by rocks and soils on Meridiani Planum, Mars: Microscopic Imager observations
176 during Opportunity’s first three extended missions. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 113,
177 E12S32, doi:10.1029/2008JE003100
- 178 McLennan, S.M., Bell, J.F., III., Calvin, W.M., Christensen, P.R., Clark, B.C., de Souza, P.A.,
179 Farmer, J., Farrand, W.H., Fike, D.A., Gellert, R., and others (2005) Provenance and diagenesis
180 of the evaporite-bearing Burns formation, Meridiani Planum, Mars. *Earth and Planetary Science*
181 *Letters*, 240, 95-121.
- 182 Morrison, S.M., Downs, R.T., Blake, D.F., Vaniman, D.T., Ming, D.W., Hazen, R.M., Treiman,
183 A.H., Achilles, C.N., Yen, A.S., Morris, R.V., Rampe, E.B., Bristow, T.R., Chipera, S.J.,
184 Sarrazin, P.C., Gellert, R., Fendrich, K.V., Morookian, J.M., Farmer, J.D., Des Marais, D.J., and
185 Craig, P.I. (2018a) Crystal chemistry of martian minerals from Bradbury Landing through
186 Naukluft Plateau, Gale crater, Mars. *American Mineralogist*, in press.
- 187 Morrison, S.M., Downs, R.T., Blake, D.F., Prabhu, A., Eleish, A., Vaniman, D.T., Ming, D.W.,
188 Rampe, E.B., Hazen, R.M., Achilles, C.N., Treiman, A.H., and others (2018b) Relationships

Velbel - H&B: Crystallography on Mars – Curiosity’s Bragging right

189 between unit-cell parameters and composition for 2 rock-forming minerals on Earth, Mars, and
190 other extraterrestrial bodies. American Mineralogist, in press.

191 Peterson, R.C., and Wang, R. (2006) Crystal molds on Mars: Melting of a possible new mineral
192 species to create Martian chaotic terrain. *Geology*, 34, 957–960; doi: 10.1130/G22678A

193 Peterson, R.C., Nelson, W., Madu, B., and Shurvell, H.F. (2007) Meridianiite: A new mineral
194 species observed on Earth and predicted to exist on Mars. *American Mineralogist*, 92, 1756-
195 1759.

196 Rieder, R., Gellert, R., Anderson, R.C., Brückner, J., Clark, B.C., Dreibus, G., Economou, T.,
197 Klingelhöfer, G., Lugmair, G.W., Ming, D.W., Squyres, S.W., d’Uston, C., Wänke, H., Yen, A.,
198 and Zipfel, J. (2004) Chemistry of rocks and soils at Meridiani Planum from the Alpha Particle
199 X-ray Spectrometer. *Science*, 306, 1746-1749.

200 Squyres, S.W., Arvidson, R.E., Bell, J.F., III, Brückner, J., Cabrol, N.A., Calvin, W., Carr, M.H.,
201 Christensen, P.R., Clark, B.C., Crumpler, L., and others (2004) The Opportunity Rover’s Athena
202 science investigation at Meridiani Planum, Mars. *Science*, 306, 1698-1703.

203 Treiman, A.H., Bish, D.L., Vaniman, D.T., Chipera, S.J., Blake, D.F., Ming, D.W., Morris, R.V.,
204 Bristow, T.F., Morrison, S.M., Baker, M.B., Rampe, E.B., and others (2016) Mineralogy,
205 provenance, and diagenesis of a potassic basaltic sandstone on Mars: CheMin X-ray diffraction
206 of the Windjana sample (Kimberley area, Gale Crater). *Journal of Geophysical Research:*
207 *Planets*, 121, 75–106, doi:10.1002/2015JE004932.