Abstract

Lunar apatites contain 100s-1000s ppm sulfur. This is puzzling because lunar basalts are thought to form in low oxygen fugacity (fO2) conditions where sulfur can only exist in its reduced form (S2-), a substitution not previously observed in natural apatite. We present measurements of the oxidation state of S in lunar apatites and associated mesostasis glass that show that lunar apatites and glass contain dominantly S2-, whereas natural apatites from Earth are only known to contain S6+. It is likely that many terrestrial and Martian igneous rocks contain apatites with mixed sulfur oxidation states. The S6+/S2- ratios of such apatites could be used to quantify the fO2s at which they crystallized, given information on the partitioning of S6+ and S2- between apatite and melt and on the S6+/S2- ratios of melts as functions of fO2 and melt composition. Such a well-oxybarometer based on this the oxidation state of S in apatite would have wide application.

Introduction

Lunar apatites, melt inclusions, and glass beads contain concentrations of H, C, S, and Cl that suggest that at least some portions of the lunar crust and/or mantle contain higher concentrations of these volatile elements than previously thought, and perhaps even in concentrations similar to those observed for Earth (Saal et al., 2008; Boyce et al. 2010; Greenwood et al. 2011; Hauri et al. 2011; Chen et al. 2015; McCubbin et al. 2015; Wetzel et al. 2015). This has led to significant recent interest in lunar volatiles and to efforts to explain these results in the context of models for the formation of the Moon. A puzzling aspect of the unexpectedly high volatile contents of lunar materials was the observation of 100s-1000s ppm S in apatite, similar to the levels observed in terrestrial igneous apatite (Boyce et al. 2010).

Terrestrial magmas typically formed at fO2 levels 4-5 orders of magnitude higher than the iron-wüstite oxygen buffer (referred to as IW+4 to +5). At these fO2s, sulfur dissolved in the silicate liquids from which terrestrial apatites crystallize is present as sulfate (i.e., SO42-, or S6+)
and sulfide (i.e., $S^{2-}$), but it has been generally believed that the sulfur in terrestrial apatites is present entirely as sulfate (Fleet 2005), with the sulfate anion in the apatite substituting for the phosphate anionic group, coupled with $SiO_4^{4-}$ or $Na^+$ to maintain charge balance (Pan and Fleet 2002). However, lunar rocks reflect much lower $fO_2$ conditions, including at the point of apatite saturation and crystallization. Lunar apatites crystallize in the interstices of lunar basalts from late-stage, highly differentiated liquids, since only in such liquids does phosphorus reach sufficient concentrations for the liquids to become saturated with respect to apatite. The $fO_2$ of these late-stage liquids in lunar basalts are constrained from petrographic descriptions of the phases present in the interstices (e.g., coexistence of Fe-metal, ulvospinel, ilmenite, and sometimes fayalite and/or silica) and are as low as IW-1 (e.g., El Goresy 1976). This is more than 4 orders of magnitude lower than the $fO_2$s required to begin to stabilize sulfate in basaltic and andesitic liquids (~IW+3.5; Botcharnikov et al. 2010; Jugo et al. 2010), and more than 3 orders of magnitude lower than needed in Fe-free or Fe-poor soda-lime, $K_2Si_4O_9$, albite, and haplontrodhjemite liquids (~IW+2.5; Klimm et al. 2012). Thus, under the reducing conditions of lunar petrogenesis, it is anticipated that nearly all S dissolved in the interstitial silicate melts in these lunar magmas will be dissolved as sulfide ($S^{2-}$), and that crystalline phases in equilibrium with the interstitial silicate melts likely contain nearly entirely sulfide. Since at the time of the discovery of 100s-1000s ppm S in lunar apatites sulfur was only known to be present in naturally occurring apatite as sulfate groups, it was not clear how to explain the incorporation of sulfur in lunar apatites (Boyce et al. 2010).

Boyce et al. (2010) speculated that the elevated S abundances of lunar apatites under conditions that are so reducing as to be highly unfavorable to stabilization of significant sulfate in the liquids with which the apatites coexisted was due to sulfide substitution into the column anion site in apatite where $F^-$, $OH^-$, and $Cl^-$ anions normally sit. Although this hypothesized substitution has until now not been observed in natural apatites, in support of their speculation, Boyce et al. (2010) pointed out that fully $S^{2-}$-substituted apatites had been synthesized experimentally (Suitch et al. 1986; Taitai and Lacout 1989; Henning et al. 2000), and since then, apatites that exhibit S-XANES spectral evidence for both sulfide and sulfate (Konecke et al. 2017a) have been synthesized. The speculation that this occurs at the column anion site also is supported by $ab\ iniito$ calculations, which show that this substitution of $S^{2-}$ is most energetically favorable in chloride-bearing apatites (Kim et al. 2017). If natural apatite can simultaneously incorporate both oxidized and reduced sulfur ($S^{6+}$ and $S^{2-}$), it is possible that their proportions could be sensitive to the $S^{6+/S^{2-}}$ ratio of the apatite growth environment, and therefore could provide a proxy for the $fO_2$ at which the apatites formed. This possibility is of interest because apatites are a common
igneous phase in a variety of rocks from Earth, Moon, and other planets and the determination of $fO_2$ is a topic of considerable interest and importance (e.g., Haggerty and Meyer 1970; Taylor et al. 1972, 2004; Sato et al. 1973; Sato 1979; Carmichael, 1991; Steele et al. 1992; Herd et al. 2002; Karner et al. 2006; Wadhwa et al. 2008; Kelley and Cottrell, 2009; Jugo et al. 2010; Wetzel et al. 2013; Brounce et al. 2017; Konecke et al. 2017a). In this paper, we report the results of x-ray absorption near edge structure spectroscopy (S-XANES, see SI Appendix) on S-bearing lunar apatite (from basalt samples 10044 and 12039) and terrestrial igneous apatite (from Durango) and demonstrate that $S^{2-}$ dominates in the lunar apatites but is undetectable in the terrestrial apatite.

**Sample Description**

Sample 12039 is a 3.2 ± 0.05 billion year old, low-TiO$_2$ basalt (Nyquist et al. 1979).

Sample 10044 is a ~3.71-3.73 billion year old, high-TiO$_2$ basalt (Turner 1970; Guggisberg et al. 1979). Both rocks are inferred to have been derived from lava flows (Klein 1972). They are slightly vesiculated (< 1%) and dominated by compositionally zoned and skeletal pyroxene, plagioclase, and ilmenite (Klein 1972). For both samples, fractionation of the basaltic magma due to crystallization at low $fO_2$ produced Fe-rich late-stage liquids, which then separated into two immiscible liquids upon further crystallization – one very Si-rich, Fe-poor melt that occurs as quenched glass containing 78 wt% SiO$_2$, 0.5 wt% FeO*, 3.2 wt% K$_2$O, 4.48 wt% CaO, and <0.03 wt% MgO (versus the bulk lava with ~47 wt% SiO$_2$, 20.39 wt% FeO*, 0.11 wt% K$_2$O, 11.6 wt% CaO, and ~8.6 wt% MgO; Boyce et al. 2014), and another lower silica, Fe-rich melt (SiO$_2$ ~47.8 wt%, FeO* ~ 20 wt%, K$_2$O ~0.3 wt%, CaO ~11.2 wt%, MgO ~ 2.3 wt%; Roedder and Weiblen 1970; Pernet-Fisher et al. 2014). Apatite can be in contact with either glass in both samples (Pernet-Fisher et al. 2014), and recent experimental data indicate that the composition of apatites among conjugate liquids are indistinguishable with respect to major and minor elements in systems that undergo silicate-liquid immiscibility (McCubbin and Ustunisik 2018). Sulfide blebs are also associated with silicate glass in the mesostasis in both samples, suggesting that apatites analyzed in this study crystallized from and equilibrated with a sulfide-saturated silicate melt (Fig 1-3). Features such as rounded silicate glass-sulfide contacts (e.g., rounded sulfide/K-glass contact in upper right region of Fig 1a, b) indicate that the sulfide was molten. The mesostasis in the thin section of sample 12039 studied here (thin section 4) also contains K, Si-rich glass, K,Ba-feldspar, troilite (distinguished from sulfide on the basis of the shape of their XANES spectra, SFig 1), plagioclase, and pyroxenes (e.g., Fig 1). Other studies of sample 12039 also report tranquillityite, native iron, cristobalite, and tridymite in the mesostasis (Bunch et al. 1972). The mesostasis in sample 10044 studied here (thin section 33) contains crystallized troilite,
plagioclase, fayalite, SiO₂, and pyroxene (e.g., Fig 3). Other studies of sample 10044 also report baddeleyite, ulvöspinel, tranquillityite, K,Ba-feldspar in hand sample, as well as K,Si-rich glass and devitrified high-Fe glass, the last two of which are interpreted as being immiscible liquids (Beaty and Albee 1978). Apatites in thin sections of both rocks have igneous textures as indicated by equant and skeletal grains with central cavities filled with glass, as well as compositionally zoned crystals (see Figs 1 and 3; Piccoli and Candela 2002). These apatites contain 100s-1000s ppm S (determined via electron probe; Greenwood et al. 2011). Apatite grains in sample 12039 have been shown to be zoned with respect to F, Cl, SiO₂, and S, which was hypothesized to reflect variations in the composition of a residual melt during apatite crystallization (Greenwood et al. 2011).

Durango apatite is from volcanogenic deposits near Durango, Mexico and is associated with magnetite in gas cavities and open breccias in sheeted flows and flow breccias from Cerro de Mercado. Halogen-rich gases are thought to have streamed through and further oxidized magnetite to hematite, setting the fO₂ conditions under which Durango apatite formed at >IW+6 (Lyons 1988). At these fO₂s, sulfur is expected in solution as S⁶⁺ (Botcharnikov et al. 2010; Jugo et al. 2010; Klimm et al. 2012).

Results

The measured S⁶⁺/ΣS ratios vary between 0 and 45% in six lunar apatite grains in thin section 12039,4 vary between 0 and 45% (Fig 1, 2, SFig 2, 3; Supplementary Table 1) and between 0 and 32% in two apatite grains in thin section 10044,33 (Fig 3, SFig4; Supplementary Table 1). The sulfur concentrations of the K,Si-rich mesostasis glass touching measured apatites in sample 12039 contain 69-107 ppm S, and two S-XANES analyses of the mesostasis glass demonstrate that sulfur is present in the mesostasis have the characteristic spectral features of dissolved S²⁻ in terrestrial basaltic liquids (e.g., Jugo et al. 2010; Brounce et al. 2017) but no spectral evidence for the presence of S⁶⁺ dissolved in the glass, resulting in a S⁶⁺/ΣS = 0% (Fig 2). More than half of all measurements on apatite (28 analyses out of 48 total analyses) have S⁶⁺/ΣS < 3%, which we consider to be indistinguishable from 0% (see SI Appendix). This is in contrast with our analyses of Durango apatite (the representative of terrestrial apatite considered in this study), which shows the characteristic spectral features of S⁶⁺, but no spectral evidence for the presence of S²⁻, resulting in a S⁶⁺/ΣS = 100% (SFig 1).

Sulfur abundances of the same apatites and glasses were measured via electron microprobe (see SI Appendix) and vary from below the detection limit (~20 ppm based on
measurements of nearby silicate minerals that are nominally free of sulfur) up to 500 ppm in thin section 12039,4 (SFig 2, 3, 5; Supplementary Table 1) and up to ~350 ppm in thin section 10044,33 (SFig 4, 6; Supplementary Table 1). Individual apatite grains are heterogeneous with respect to sulfur. Where analyzed, the sulfur abundances of the mesostasis glass in 12039,4 range from below the detection limit to ~100 ppm S (SFig 5; Supplementary Table 1).

Discussion

In apatites from both 12039 and 10044, the locations of analyses that yield S$^{6+}/\Sigma S > 3\%$ correspond with the presence of fractures and/or pits (Fig 1-3; SFig 2-4). This suggests that the S$^{6+}$ observed in these S-XANES spectra may not reflect primary sulfur incorporated into the apatite when it crystallized, but rather is either primary sulfide altered to sulfate or sulfur of secondary origin. Although it is possible that some portion of the S$^{6+}$ signal is derived from the epoxies used in making the thin sections, the sharp absorption feature that appears at ~2474 eV in the epoxies, which does not appear in the mineral standards or in apatite measurements, and the low intensity of the S$^{6+}$ peak in the epoxy (~2482 eV; SFig 1) in each thin section limits the proportion that epoxy can contribute to the measured absorption spectra in apatite to < 1% (SFig 1). There also could be secondary sulfate-bearing materials precipitated in the fractures and pits of the thin sections of these rocks, but, if so, we have no basis for evaluating whether these could be of terrestrial or lunar origin. Chlorine isotope measurements of the so called “rusty” rock (Apollo sample 66095) suggest a lunar origin for oxidation and hydration induced, Cl-bearing minerals observed in Apollo 16 samples (Shearer et al. 2014), and it is thus possible that apatites in Apollo 11 and 12 samples studied here are susceptible to similar fumerolic alteration (e.g., Konecke et al. 2017b). On the other hand, measurements of the hydrogen isotope contents of lunar apatites near fractures reveal distinctly terrestrial surface water signatures (Greenwood et al. 2011), and this terrestrial water contamination may have been associated with deposition of micro-to-nano-scale S$^{6+}$-bearing phases. Finally, while all spectra that indicate S$^{6+}/\Sigma S > 3\%$ are near fractures and pits in the thin section, there are some spectra that are near fractures or pits and do not have significantly elevated S$^{6+}/\Sigma S$ ratios (Fig 1-3; SFig 2-4), suggesting that if the oxidized sulfur we have detected is from secondary sulfate-bearing materials in the fractures and pits of these thin sections, these sulfates are heterogeneously distributed. The key point is that analyses taken far from fractures and pits are uniformly lacking in S$^{6+}$ absorption features (i.e., S$^{6+}/\Sigma S < 3\%$; e.g., Fig 3).
Lunar basalts are also variably affected by subsolidus reactions, for instance, as the result of interaction between their primary mineral assemblages and implanted solar wind hydrogen (e.g., sample 14053; Taylor et al. 2004). It is possible that some or all of the $S^{2-}$ found in lunar apatites measured in this study was formed as the result of interaction between solar wind hydrogen and sulfur-bearing phases such as troilite (i.e., reducing $Fe^{2+}$ to $Fe^0$ and making $S^{2-}$ available to diffuse into pre-existing, sulfide-poor or -free apatite), and thus do not record the $f_{O_2}$ of the igneous system described by the bulk rock. However, unlike apatite grains in sample 14053, where solar wind implantation may have lowered the hydrogen isotopic compositions of apatite grains in thin section from their primary values, the hydrogen isotopic compositions of apatite grains in samples 12039 and 10044 are higher ($\delta D$ in apatites from 14053 vary from $-100$ to $-200\%$, from 12039 vary from $+400$ to $+1000\%$, from 10044 vary from $+550$ to $+750\%$; (Greenwood et al. 2011). Solar wind has low D/H ratios, so the D-enrichment of apatite in the rocks studied here limits the extent to which solar wind implantation influenced incorporation of $S^{2-}$ into apatite. Apollo rocks are also variably influenced by impact-related metamorphism and metasomatism. For example, abundant apatite found in granulite 79215 were hypothesized to be condensed from a halogen-rich vapor (Treiman et al. 2014). However, apatite grains in the mare basalts studied here have distinctly igneous textures, including being embayed by and displaying resorption textures with the mesostasis melt (e.g., Fig 1, 3, SFig 2-4), indicating that apatite was present in the rock at the time the mesostasis was liquid. Our preferred interpretation of $S^{2-}$-only lunar apatites in this study is that this reflects the low $f_{O_2}$ conditions of the magma at the time of apatite crystallization.

The mesostasis glass in sample 12039 contains 70-110 ppm sulfur and that sulfur is entirely present as $S^{2-}$ (Supplementary Table 1, SFig 5). For Apollo 12 basalts, experiments and petrographic observations suggest that olivine and pigeonite are the liquidus phases at an $f_{O_2} \approx IW$ (Green et al. 1971; Rhodes et al. 1977). The presence of Fe-metal and troilite, and in some cases fayalite, Fe-metal, and silica, or of ulvöspinel, Fe-metal, and ilmenite in the mesostasis reflects $f_{O_2} \leq IW-1$, consistent with differentiation (i.e., low-pressure crystallization and degassing) having led to a decrease of at least an order of magnitude in $f_{O_2}$. This could be driven by degassing of a C-H-O-S vapor, which has been shown to be an effective means of reducing the $f_{O_2}$ of Hawaiian magmas by $\sim 1$ order of magnitude (Moussallam et al. 2016; Helz et al. 2017; Brounce et al. 2017), and has been suggested for lunar basalts previously (Brett 1976). Based on these previous results, the liquids from which lunar apatites in basalts crystallized clearly experienced $f_{O_2}$s at which sulfur is expected in solution as $S^{2-}$, as confirmed by our S-XANES analyses of the mesostasis glass from sample 12039 and consistent with our S-XANES
measurements on apatite far from cracks and pits from both 12039 and 10044 (Fig 1-4). These latter results contrast with our S-XANES results on the Durango apatite, which has $S^{6+}/\Sigma S = 100\%$ (SFig 1).

Paired glass-apatite measurements in sample 12039 enable an estimate of the partition coefficient of sulfide for apatite coexisting with K-Si-rich mesostasis melt. Taking the average sulfide concentration of the mesostasis glass in sample 12039 (88 ppm; Supplementary Table 1) and of the apatite measurements in the same thin section (176 ppm, assuming that $S^{6+}/\Sigma S$ of lunar apatite at the time of apatite crystallization is zero), then for conditions appropriate for apatite crystallization in the mesostasis of sample 12039, $D_{S^{2-}}^{ap/liq} \approx 2 \pm 1$. Importantly, however, apatite-melt coefficients may vary as a function of temperature, pressure, melt composition, apatite composition, and/or oxygen fugacity, so the combined effects of these parameters must be investigated further before being applied broadly to determine sulfur abundances of coexisting melt from apatite $S^{2-}$ abundances.

**Implications**

We have documented the occurrence of $S^{2-}$-only apatite in nature (Fig 1, 3 SFig 3, SFig 4). Although not unexpected from the experimental synthesis of sulfoapatites, *ab initio* calculations, and recent synthesis of mixed $S^{6+}/S^{2-}$ apatites, this is the first documentation of its natural occurrence. This observation confirms speculation of Boyce et al. (2010) that the elevated S contents of lunar apatites crystallized from melts that record $fO_2$s at which silicate melts are expected to have only $S^{2-}$ are due to the ability of $S^{2-}$ to partition into the apatite mineral structure. Finally, this study, in combination with the recent experimental work of Konecke et al. (2017a, b), suggest that a S-in-apatite oxybarometer could be developed and applied to igneous rocks from a variety of planetary bodies in our solar system.

The $S^{6+}/\Sigma S$ of an individual silicate melt transitions from 0% to 100% over ~two orders of magnitude in $fO_2$. The range over which this transition occurs for an individual melt depends on its major element composition, i.e., the midpoint of this transition for the melts for which this transition has been measured varies from QFM-0.5 (IW+3) to QFM+1 (IW+4.5) (Botcharnikov et al. 2010; Jugo et al. 2010; Klimm et al. 2012). Apatites coexisting with a given melt over the $fO_2$ range of this transition are anticipated to contain both $S^{6+}$ and $S^{2-}$ and thus could be used to quantify the $fO_2$ of the system at the time of apatite crystallization. In detail the $fO_2$ dependence of the transition in $S^{6+}/\Sigma S$ for apatites coexisting with melt undergoing the same transition will depend on the individual partition coefficients of $S^{2-}$ and $S^{6+}$ between apatite and melt and the
major element composition of the melt (including the oxidation states of other heterovalent elements). Thus, development of an oxybarometer based on the $S^{6+}/\Sigma S$ of apatite would require experimental work to determine the individual partition coefficients of $S^{2-}$ and $S^{6+}$ between apatite and melt, and a quantification of the extent to which those partition coefficients vary as a function of pressure, temperature, oxygen fugacity, melt composition, and apatite composition. Although such experiments and measurements will probably not be simple, given the widespread occurrence of apatite in igneous rocks from Earth and other planets, and the interest in the $fO_2$s at which they formed (and their variations), such an oxybarometer would likely be useful. In particular, given the $fO_2$ range over which this transition is expected to occur for terrestrial magmas based on their major element compositions (Botcharnikov et al. 2010; Jugo et al. 2010), the $fO_2$ ranges of terrestrial magmas (Carmichael 1991), and the capacity of XANES for measurements of sulfide/sulfate ratios in experimental and natural glasses (Brounce et al. 2017), S-XANES measurements can be expected to readily detect sulfide-dominated apatites, mixed sulfide-sulfate apatites, and sulfate-dominated apatites (as in the case for the Durango apatite we studied) in terrestrial igneous rocks and that these results can, with appropriate experimental calibration, be used quantitatively as an apatite oxybarometer for igneous rocks ranging in composition from basalt to rhyolite. In addition to Earth and the Moon, apatites are found in lavas from planetary bodies distributed throughout the solar system (McCubbin and Jones 2015) and an apatite-based oxybarometer could be useful in constraining the $fO_2$ of lavas from Mars and the howardite-eucrite-diogenite parent body (e.g., Herd et al. 2002; Shearer et al. 2006; Wadhwa 2008).

Finally, we note that $S^{2-}$ likely partitions into the column anion site in apatite as a substitution for two $F^-$, $Cl^-$, and/or $OH^-$ anions. Thus, the abundance of $S^{2-}$ in apatites may be useful in studies seeking to constrain the abundance of $F$, $Cl$, and $H_2O$ in magmas based on their concentrations in apatite.

**Acknowledgments**

We thank A. Lanzirotti and M. Newville for assistance in beamline operations at the Advanced Photon Source, Argonne National Laboratory (APS ANL). This research was performed at GeoSoilEnviroCARS (The University of Chicago, Sector 13), APS ANL. GeoSoilEnviroCARS is supported by the National Science Foundation – Earth Sciences (EAR-1634415) and Department of Energy – GeoSciences (DE-FG02-94ER14466). This research used resources of APS, a US Department of Energy (DOE) Office of Science user facility operated for the DOE Office of...
Science by ANL under Contract No. DE-AC02-06CH11357. Support for this research was provided by NASA’s Planetary Science Research Program. We also thank the curatorial staff at NASA Johnson Space Center for allocations of Apollo samples for this study.

References cited


**Figure Captions**

Figure 1. A) and B) Backscatter electron and C) S-P-Na (R-G-B) maps that show the locations of analyses in thin section 12039,4 area 4. Black circles in panel A mark to the locations of cracks and pits that cross the analysis transect. Phases are labelled in panel B (Ap = apatite; S = sulfide; Fa = fayalite; Plag = plagioclase; Pyx = pyroxene; K,Ba-feld = K,Ba-feldspar; K-glass = K-rich mesostasis glass). In panel C, sulfide grains/blebs appear as red, apatite grains appear as green, and mesostasis glass appears as bright blue. The size of the beam is smaller than the symbol size. Hollow diamonds are saved stage motor positions that were not analyzed. Filled white, yellow, and red diamonds are analyzed positions. D) Calculated $S^{6+}/\Sigma S$ ratio from spectra at each analysis point from Fig. 1. Locations of cracks and pits near analysis points (see panel A) are marked by gray dashed lines. Dark gray field marks $S^{6+}/\Sigma S > 3\%$. Analytical uncertainties are smaller than symbol size.

Figure 2. A) Normalized S-XANES spectra for (top panel) gypsum (black curve), troilite (gray curve), and sulfide blebs in Apollo sample 12039,4 area 4 (red and yellow curves) and (bottom panel) epoxy in thin section 10044,33 (light green curve) and 12039,4 (dark green curve). B) S-XANES spectra for analysis points on apatite (q, n), mesostasis glass (i), and sulfide bleb (j). In panels A and B, the position of absorption peaks traditionally assigned to $S^{2-}$ (2466, 2470, and 2478 eV) and $S^{6+}$ (2482 eV) are marked in vertical black dashed lines. The black curves are data,
the green curves are synthetic spectra produced from linear combinations of spectra collected on
gypsum and troilite to provide a best fit to the data (see SI Appendix).

Figure 3. A) and B) Maps as in Fig 1 that shows the locations of analyses in thin section
10044,33. Colors in panel B are as in Fig 1. C) S-XANES spectra for analysis points on apatite.
The position of absorption peaks traditionally assigned to S\(^{2-}\) (2466, 2470, and 2478 eV) and S\(^{6+}\)
(2482 eV) are marked in vertical gray lines. All apatite measurements lack spectral evidence for
S\(^{6+}\) and thus have S\(^{6+}/\Sigma S = 0\).

Figure 4. The relationship between S\(^{6+}/\Sigma S\) ratios of igneous apatites and fO\(_2\) at the time of apatite
crystallization from natural apatites (gray stars, this study) and experimentally grown apatites
(white stars, Konecke et al. 2017a). Error bars on gray stars represent the full range of S\(^{6+}/\Sigma S\)
ratios observed in measurements of lunar apatites and Durango apatite (i.e., lunar apatite
measurements yield S\(^{6+}/\Sigma S\) ratios as high as 45%, but we hypothesize that the sulfate signal
originates from alteration or secondary mineralization after sample collection; Durango apatite
measurements show no spectral evidence of sulfide). Error bars on the experimentally grown
apatite data point reflect the full range of S\(^{6+}/\Sigma S\) of apatite reported for that experiment
equilibrated at IW+3 (Konecke et al., 2017a). Also shown are the current accepted fO\(_2\) ranges of
typical terrestrial and Martian magmas (black horizontal lines with arrows). Though in detail the
relationship between magmatic fO\(_2\) and apatite S\(^{6+}/\Sigma S\) ratios will likely have a dependence on
melt chemistry, the transition from sulfide-only to sulfate-only apatites appears to occur in a
narrow fO\(_2\) range between ~IW+2 and ~IW+4, suggesting that a S-in-apatite oxybarometer could
be useful in constraining fO\(_2\) in a variety of terrestrial and Martian igneous rocks.
Figure 1

Always consult and cite the final, published document. See http://www.minsocam.org or GeoscienceWorld
Figure 2

A.

B.
Figure 3
Figure 4

- **Natural apatites**
- **this study**
- **Experimentally grown apatites**
  Konecke et al., 2017

- **fO₂ range, Martian magmas**
- **fO₂ range, typical terrestrial magmas**

- **S⁶⁺S⁴⁺**
- **fO₂ (IW)**

- **Full range observed sulfur oxidation**

- **Lunar**

- **Terrestrial**