

Minutes of the Third 2012 Council Meeting
Mineralogical Society of America
Saturday, 3 November 2012
Harris Room, Westin Charlotte Hotel, Charlotte, NC

Attending:

Mike Hochella, President
John Hughes, Vice-President
David Bish, Past President
Darrell Henry, Treasurer
Andrea Koziol, Secretary
Kim Tait, Councilor
Christine Clark, Councilor
Pamela Burnley, Councilor
Guy Hovis, Councilor
Wendy Bohrson, Councilor

Visitors:

J. Alex Speer, MSA Executive Director
Howard Day, Treasurer-elect
Rachel Russell, managing editor, *American Mineralogist*
Kirsten Nicolaysen, Councilor-elect
Jenny Thomson, editor of *American Mineralogist*
David Vaughan, Vice-President-elect

Not Present:

Sumit Chakraborty, Councilor

Note: Motions and Council action items are presented in *italics*; SoC = sense of Council

ITEMS

[1] Call to order and Roll Call

Mike Hochella called the meeting to order at 8:00 AM.

[2] Additions to and deletions from the Agenda, approval of the Agenda.

Additional reports that arrived late:

1. The Report on American Geological Institute “Classification of Geoscience Programs” Initiative: by David Mogk is for information only and does not need to be discussed.
2. Draft version of MSA Policy Statement “Education in the Mineral Sciences” – for discussion later

C. Clark moved that the Agenda be approved, D. Henry seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[3] Accept Reports to Council containing no questions or action items as a group.

Publications Director, Editors *American Mineralogist*, Series Editor of the Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry & Monographs Series, MSA Society News Editor for *Elements*, Editor of the *Handbook of Mineralogy*, MSA Representative to the *GeoScienceWorld* Board of Directors, MSA Representative to the *GeoScienceWorld* Advisory Council, Meetings Coordinator, MSA Webmaster, and the Interest group for Pegmatites and Planetary Materials.

Liaisons to the American Crystallographic Association, American Geological Institute, Clay Minerals Society, European Mineralogical Union, Gemological Institute of America, Geological Society of America, and Geological Society of America's Mineralogy, Geochemistry, Petrology, and Volcanology Division (GSA-MGPV).

Not heard from: Liaisons to International Mineralogical Association (IMA), Friends of Mineralogy (FM), the International Centre for Diffraction Data (ICDD), Society of Mineral Museum Professionals (SMMP), and the AGU Mineral Physics Focus Group.

W. Bohrson moved to accept all reports as submitted, G. Hovis seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[4] Approve the minutes of the 2nd 2012 Council Meeting.

D. Bish moved that the minutes be accepted, D. Henry seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[5] Review of Executive Committee actions. Any items for action or discussion from the President's Report were taken up under the appropriate sections later in the day.

(a) The Executive Committee had voted unanimously to support the VGP/MSA reception at the \$2K level. John Hughes will go to AGU this December to participate in and observe the event so that he can judge its effectiveness. He will also network with Steve Sparks, Catherine McCammon, and any other Section or Focus Group officers he wishes. And finally, John will present the Dana Medal to Max Schmidt. Reports from John Hughes will help the Executive Committee judge whether continued support of this reception is warranted.

A short explanation of this item was provided by M. Hochella.

[6] Accept medal, award, grant, and honor recommendations provided by the committees involved.

The following are the four nominated MSA medalists and awardees:

Roebing Medal (2013): *Frank C. Hawthorne*

Dana Medal (2014): *Patricia M. Dove*

MSA Award (2013): *Wendy Li-Wen Mao*

Distinguished Public Service Award (2013): *Pierrette Tremblay*

The following individuals were nominated as new MSA Fellows:

Alan Anderson, Tim Lowenstein, Charles Leshner, Abby Kavner, Keiko Hattori, Francois Holtz, Sun-Lin Chung, James Van Orman, Shigeaki Ono, Hongwu Xu, Monika Koch-Müller, Pamela Burnley, and Jane Gilotti

The Crystallographic Research Grant was recommended for: *Arianna Gleason*
The Mineralogy/Petrology Research Grants were recommended for: *Christopher James Spencer, and John G. Warden*

It was noted in a short discussion that the timing of the deadlines and awarding of these grants precluded most Master's students from applying.

Motion to accept these recommendations made by C. Clark. D. Henry seconded. Approved by A. Koziol, D. Bish, G. Hovis, C. Clark, D. Henry, K. Tait, W. Bohrson. M. Hochella, J. Hughes, and P. Burnley recused themselves.

[7] There are additional items about awards:

- a) The Mineralogy/Petrology Research Grant Committee makes two suggestions:
 - a. Committee members' terms of service be extended to 4 years, where the 4th year the member serves only as an alternate in case one of the other members cannot serve.

P. Burnley moved to accept term of service extended to 4 years, where in the 4th year the member serves as an alternate. C. Clark seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

- b. Clarification of the focus of the award in regards to weighting of "stand-alone" proposals versus those which seem to have been "lifted" from other grant applications.

Christine Clark led this discussion as this topic affected the Mineralogy/Petrology Research Grant committee. Discussion followed as to what changes should be made in the award guidelines and in the award description.

SoC: The new Chair of the Mineralogy/Petrology Research Grant committee will rewrite description and guidelines to clarify that the submitted proposals should be written by the student proposer. C. Clark will work with this councilor on the wording.

- b) Council will need to decide when and where to present Pierrette Tremblay the Distinguished Public Service Award.

This item was tabled. M. Hochella will talk with P. Tremblay to decide when to present her with this award.

[8] MSA Committee membership and appointed posts for 2013 as recommended by the Committee on Committees.

John Hughes, as chair of this committee, made a few comments. There were no other additions or comments by Council.

[9] The Nominating Committee for Officers presented a list of possible candidates for Vice-President and for Councilors. The list must be reviewed, ordered, and approved so that the MSA Secretary can contact those on the list in the sequence decided by Council to invite them to run for office.

M. Hochella and A. Koziol described the list of nominees for first, the Vice Presidential position, then petrology candidates for council, and mineralogy candidates for council, that had been refined by MSA's Executive Committee. A brief discussion ensued resulting in more minor modifications.

G. Hovis moved to approve the modified list. D. Henry seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[10] The MSA Representative to *Elements* Magazine Executive Committee asks MSA to forward nominations for the "mineralogy" Principal Editor to the *Elements*' representative (Barb Dutrow) by 25 November 2012.

Council asked D. Vaughan for suggestions, given his history with *Elements* magazine. He suggested Frank Hawthorne, Ed Grew, Bob Hazen, and Brad Hacker.

[11] M. Hochella introduces draft policy statement of Education in the Mineral Sciences, authored by David Mogk, with review and comments by others. More discussion will happen later in this meeting.

MSA Executive Director Alex Speer reminded Council of the usual procedure for policy statements. A version of the statement is written and refined, and, with Council approval, put out to the memberships for comments. The statement is then rewritten with these comments in mind for a final decision by Council whether or not to adopt.

[12] Consider recommendations of staff evaluations from the Management Committee of the preceding day.

Recommendations were reported orally. The Management Committee reported their recommendations, and raises, to the full council. After a short discussion Council was in agreement with the committee's recommendations.

Motion to approve the Management Committee's recommendations was made by D. Bish. K. Tait seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[13] The Executive Director requests that Council accept the 2012 election results and give permission to destroy the paper ballots and the electronic ballot files upon acceptance.

G. Hovis moved to accept the results. D. Henry seconded. Motion passed unanimously by those present (a few councilors absent as they were not back from break)

[14] Council needs to decide on a time and location for its Spring 2013 Council meeting.

This item was tabled, and will be discussed later in the day.

[15] The Treasurer has no specific action items relating to 2011 finances for the 2012 Council, but the 2013 budget will need to be approved during the First 2013 Council Meeting this afternoon. The Treasurer described highlights and answered questions.

D. Henry reported we have a clean audit at draft stage, and our total investments as of October 30 were \$2.6M, up a little and on track with previous years. We continue with our investment advisor Jeff Le Clair. There have been minor changes in some holdings, but in general a conservative strategy is being pursued.

There are some caveats, however. There is the possibility of changes in world markets, because of a) possible instability in the Eurozone, b) the outcome of the American presidential election, and c) the potential sequestration of the federal budget in January 2013.

D. Henry also noted that fund transfers are similar to past years. There was about a \$20,000 increase from GeoScienceWorld from last year. MSA is doing well compared to other small scientific societies.

G. Hovis suggested that in comparing this year's budget with previous years' budgets, the use of constant dollars might be helpful in the future.

Alex Speer had several updates and informational points for the Council. He noted that renewals for 2013 were on track and about \$25,000 had been contributed by members as part of their renewals so far. He also had a copy of the MSA Employee Handbook available, for Council's information.

Update on Springer Verlag, and possible distribution of *American Mineralogist*: Springer has been sold to a private equity firm, so this plan is uncertain. If an agreement with Springer cannot be reached, MSA will need to fall back on the less attractive options of what are termed "gateways", such as EBSCO, Gale, ProQuest. Another possibility is to re-examine Googlebooks.

MSA website, especially the front page: progress has been slow but Gordon Nord will have something for us soon.

There was a suggestion for an improved MSA-talk email subscription program. Having an archive of past messages would be helpful, as would a setting where a subscriber could option for a "digest", - one message a week, containing all the e-mails of that week. Alex Speer reports there is such a program, called Mailman, which we are currently using for the Meteoritical Society.

[16] The Executive Director recommends that MSA participate in CLOCKSS (Controlled Lots of Copies Keep Stuff Safe), a not-for-profit, joint venture between scholarly publishers and research libraries to build a geographically distributed dark archive of on-line scholarly publications.

MSA executive director J. Alex Speer summarized what CLOCKSS is and what it can do for MSA and its publications. The cost to MSA is \$1000/year (expected to increase over time) and all set-up fees would be waived. His advice is that we go ahead with this dark archive. Rachel Russell, Managing Editor of *American Mineralogist*, agreed. This is a contract, and Council must approve.

J. Hughes so moved, D. Henry seconded. All approved, except for 2 abstentions (C. Clark and G. Hovis).

[17] The MSA Representative to *Elements Magazine* Executive Committee requests approval of the 2013 Elements budget.

There was no discussion of this item.

C. Clark made a motion to approve the budget. G. Hovis seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[18] Council needs to decide on a time and location for its Spring 2013 Council meeting.

Several options were discussed and meeting at the MSA offices in Chantilly, VA seemed the best option. K. Nicolaysen will conduct a poll over e-mail to determine the best date.

SoC: Spring Council meeting will take place at the MSA offices, at a date to be determined soon.

[19] The Financial Advisory and Audit Committee (FAAC) asks Council to

- a) approve a revised version of MSA's Investment Policy document.

There were no comments on this document. *D. Bish made a motion to approve the revised version, W. Bohrson seconded. Motion passed unanimously.*

- b) continue the conservative approach in the expenditure of endowment funds for the operation of the Society.
- c) solicit endowment funds from members and outside donors, in an effort to maintain the ongoing financial health of MSA.

M. Hochella asked that council note these points.

[20] The Benefactors Committee asks Council

- a) to relay any prospective donor corporations **and** contacts therein to John M. Hughes, Chair of this committee.
- b) to approve the presented policy regarding review and approval of proposals for external funding submitted on behalf of the Society:

“Proposals to external funding agencies (not including requests for Benefactor support) submitted in the name of the Mineralogical Society of America must be approved by the Executive Committee after consultation with the Executive Director. Typically such proposals would be submitted to the Executive Committee by the Chair of the Benefactors Committee. The Executive Committee will evaluate each proposal in terms of appropriateness of the funding source and whether the proposal outcomes are appropriate to the goals of the Mineralogical Society of America. The Executive Committee will be expected to consult with others within the organization as appropriate.”

J. Hughes presented the rationale for such a policy.

C. Clark moved to accept the policy as printed in the agenda, and G. Hovis seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[21] GS President Rick Carlson offered the electronic Geochemical Society (GS) *Geochemical News* to the MSA membership, this to help balance what MSA does for them via the *Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry*.

This item was tabled until later in the meeting.

[22] The Short Course Committee has one action item:

- a) Approve the short course and Reviews volume on “*Geochemistry of Geologic CO₂ Sequestration*” by Don DePaolo, Dave Cole, Alex Navrotsky and Ian Bourg.

Alex Speer noted that this Short Course is now planned to take place around the same time as the Fall 2013 American Geophysical Union meeting. Discussion followed. It was suggested a special session at AGU could be proposed, to coordinate with this Short course. Councilors suggested that this be a visible short course, with the aims well-defined.

Although a motion was not necessary (as the Short Course Committee is a standing Committee), *a motion to approve the Short Course was made by J. Hughes. It was seconded by Pam Burnley. Motion passed unanimously.*

[23] Keith Putirka, California State University, and Frank J. Tepley, Oregon State University propose that MSA establish a Penrose- and Chapman-style Conference series that is designed to promote open discussion in a less formal setting than a short course.

This topic was introduced but tabled until later in the day.

[24] Robert Finkelman, University of Texas at Dallas, and chair of GSA's Geology and Health Division requested MSA's (\$5,000+) co-sponsorship of a medical geology conference (MEDGEO 2013), Arlington, VA, August 25-29, 2013.

Alex Speer said there has been no response from the organizers of why the meeting must be organized to be non-self-supporting. A short discussion followed.

It was SoC not to pursue this sponsorship.

[25] The Outreach Committee (K-12) notes the *Mineralogy4Kids* website is heavily used by schools and the analytics show that access to the site via an iPad has been increasing, indicating that students are accessing the site using the tablet. An app (short for application) would ease access to the site, eliminating the need to go through a browser. The website was optimized for the major operating systems and only needs some "tweaking" in order for it to be completely compatible with the iPad operating system.

Alex discussed that his and Gordon Nord's best sense is to optimize the website for iPad and mobile devices. Alex pointed out that to hire a company to prepare a (true) app for such an interactive site could cost \$40,000 (Gordon Nord's estimate). An alternative would be a limited app that acts as a one-click link to the site. J. Hughes pointed out that NSF (National Science Foundation) supported the creation of the MSA website and *Mineralogy 4 Kids*, but the society must support the website from now on. Update to and optimizing the *Mineralogy 4 Kids* website is the first goal to be discussed in proposals to potential benefactors.

It was SoC to optimize the website for mobile devices and tablets. K. Nicolaysen and J. Hughes will follow up on this topic, and explore the possibilities of an app.

[26] Mickey Gunter of the Bloss Crystallography Fund committee says that a decision needs to be made about how to efficiently distribute "awards" from this fund.

M. Gunter led discussion on this topic. The Fund has exceeded \$50,000 in size. He suggested running small participatory short courses with emphasis on optical mineralogy and crystallography. The Bloss fund would fully support the cost of these short courses.

SoC: The Council likes M. Gunter's direction, but asks that he develop a more formal proposal. With the help of J. Hughes, Council requests the development of a committee to administer the Bloss fund. M. Gunter can report to the Executive Committee on this topic.

[27] Approve the package of documents to domesticate MSA as a Virginia corporation, and call for a ballot vote by the members with a recommendation to members to approve the Plan of Domestication, the Amended and Restated Articles of Incorporation, and the Amended and Restated Bylaws of the Society.

Alex Speer presented the results of his extensive work on the complex change of bringing the MSA from a District of Columbia “Old Act” corporation to a Virginia corporation. Both the Articles of Incorporation and Bylaws of MSA must be amended and restated in this change.

Alex explained that after Council’s approval, the next step is that the documents would go to the general membership to be apprised of the changes and then vote. There would be a 60-day window for notification and a 30-day window for the balloting. After being approved by the membership, the documents would go to our attorney, for filing with both DC and Virginia.

There were some questions for clarification and discussion of the Bylaws. When referenced in the documents, is the Society to be referred to as “MSA” or “the MSA”? Alex noted that the Liability section shows the most changes. Also, the term Management Committee will not be used any more, its functions being taken over by the Executive Committee.

The motion before the Council is to approve the Resolution of the Council of the Mineralogical Society of America, approving the Plan of Domestication, the Amended and Restated Articles of Incorporation, and the Amended and Restated Bylaws of the Society, as amended here, and giving the Executive Director the authority to make non-substantive corrections approved by the president.

This was so moved by J. Hughes, seconded by D. Henry. Motion passed unanimously.

[28] Mike Hochella would like a discussion of *Elements* subscriptions outside of the present model (BlueBook Section 1). He would like ideas on how to include much larger organizations like AGU, GSA (USA), and GSA (Australia) into the *Elements* family, allowing their members who are not a member of a society already subscribing to *Elements* as a whole to gain direct access to this magazine through a subscription. It is a complex issue, with potentially far-reaching implications – both in terms of policy (*Elements* was started with the idea that small societies could offer their members an important and attractive publication as a benefit) and practice (to keep costs low, subscriptions are sold in bulk to participating societies who maintain and supply the mailing databases rather than sold on an individual basis). Although MSA is just one of 17 societies that subscribes to *Elements*, it is still important for MSA Council to discuss this issue.

Mike Hochella led the discussion by listing several advantages we have because of our Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with AGU. He wished to discuss the idea of bringing *Elements* to the AGU audience. The *Elements* Executive Committee has given M. Hochella (as AGU liaison) to go ahead and explore this possibility.

Discussion continued, first on the possible unintended consequences of offering *Elements* subscriptions this way – we may not yet be aware of the downsides of this model. MSA is a founding member of the Societies that formed *Elements*, and AGU would be operating under a different model. Secondly, with this action, would *Elements* cease to be

a unique offering and a recruiting tool for some of the smaller societies in the *Elements* family? On the other hand, would this action increase the exposure of MSA to other scientists in AGU? Perhaps MSA could increase its membership.

At this point in the discussion, M. Hochella brought back for discussion item [29].

[29] GS President Rick Carlson offered the electronic Geochemical Society (GS) *Geochemical News* to the MSA membership, this to help balance what MSA does for them via the *Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry*.

Discussion continued, with the addition of [29] as a topic. The offer of the electronic *Geochemical News* is no-cost (for now) to MSA, but this can get very complicated. MSA cannot just hand over the emails of its members, because of privacy and other issues. MSA's own information is distributed via 2 pages in *Elements*, published 6 times a year. Some timely information is announced to all members on MSA-Announce. Other information is sent out on MSA-Talk but not all members sign up for MSA-Talk, which is really for chat or requests for information.

The sense of the discussion was that it might be time for an MSA electronic newsletter, distributed via e-mail, to supplement the pages in *Elements*, but this cannot be an additional project for the Business Office or Editorial Office staff. Jenny Thomson (visiting outgoing *American Mineralogist* editor) volunteered to spearhead a pilot project, provisionally called the E-Lattice. A. Koziol volunteered to aid J. Thomson in this project.

SoC: MSA will not pursue the offer of Geochemical News as offered by the Geochemical Society.

SoC: We will pursue our own electronic newsletter.

[30] Discussion of *American Mineralogist*.

Outgoing *American Mineralogist* editor Jenny Thomson started her comments by acknowledging Rachel Russell, Managing Editor, as integral to the journal. She then reported on many good things that have happened in the last year and plans for the future, including invited reviews. Submission to publication times are about 9 months for regular manuscripts, and 4 months for letters. The impact factor is 2.1.

Rachel Russell added that review papers can be longer than a typical journal paper, for those thinking of this. Payments from GeoScienceWorld (GSW) are significant and come from two sources: money for the amount of content posted on GSW, and money for each time someone clicks on an article from one of MSA's publications.

M. Hochella pointed out that the impact factor of *American Mineralogist*, while improving, has stagnated while other comparable journals have gone up, maybe by 100%

or so. It is true commercial publishers have a larger reach than we do, but we have more reach with GeoScienceWorld than before.

Various councilors added their comments and suggestions, such as: sponsoring more sessions at AGU meetings; encouraging presenters to submit their eventual manuscripts to *American Mineralogist*; asking our own libraries to subscribe to GSW. Page charges were brought up; it was suggested that MSA members be told that page charges could be waived, as it is clear that the most important task of *American Mineralogist* is to obtain the best papers.

Alex Speer commented that GSW has 480 subscribers. Springer Link, for example is an order magnitude larger, and has among its subscribers, in addition to the earth science, chemistry, physics, biology, material science, and medical libraries. Given that the journal content is applicable to these other fields, it is important that MSA find a way to make the journal accessible to these other fields. They are unlikely to subscribe to the journal, so participation in databases or other aggregates will be investigated.

[31] (re-introduced) Keith Putirka, California State University, and Frank J. Tepley, Oregon State University propose that MSA establish a Penrose- and Chapman-style Conference series that is designed to promote open discussion in a less formal setting than a short course. They are willing to organize an inaugural conference “*Mixing, Recharge and Eruption Triggering Mechanisms at Arc Volcanoes*”. One reason to do this - Penrose and Chapman conferences often result in theme issues (with contributions from non-attendees), the individual papers of which are often well cited. A conference series would be a mechanism attract more cutting edge papers to the *American Mineralogist*, and from a non-traditional author pool. They suggest the Conference series be named.

W. Bohrson re-introduced this topic. A theme or special issue based on work presented at this conference, for example, could bring in manuscripts from the igneous petrology community, who may not normally publish in *American Mineralogist*. Such a conference could reach out to young petrologists in particular. J. Thomson concurred.

Alex Speer pointed out that MSA could have these conferences as well as the Short Courses as they currently exist. The use of the title Workshop would imply a more “hands-on” experience. As short courses lead to RiMG volumes, such a conference could lead to *American Mineralogist* articles, a special issue, or an Open Access notes on the MSA website. J. Thomson noted that the model should be sustainable, and not dependent on the energy and initiative of one person.

SoC: Encourage K. Putirka to pursue this idea of a conference series.

J. Hughes moved to adjourn, W. Bohrson seconded. Motion passed unanimously at 3:20 PM.